

Legislative Assembly Province of Alberta

No. 2

# **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

First Session

Thirty-First Legislature

Tuesday, October 31, 2023

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

The Speaker offered a prayer and a moment of silence was observed in recognition of the death of former Members Marie J. Laing, Member for Edmonton-Avonmore, 1986 to 1993; A. Stephen Stiles, Member for Olds-Didsbury, 1982 to 1986; Ken Lemke, Member for Stony Plain, 2012 to 2015; Frederick A. Stewart, Member for Calgary-North Hill, 1986 to 1993; David J. Russell, Member for Calgary-Victoria Park, 1967 to 1971, and Calgary-Elbow, 1971 to 1989; Neville S. Roper, Member for Ponoka, 1967 to 1971; Peter Knaak, Member for Edmonton-Whitemud, 1979 to 1982; J.A. Denis Herard, Member for Calgary-Egmont, 1993 to 2008; Moe Amery, Member for Calgary-East, 1993 to 2015; Greg Stevens, Member for Banff-Cochrane, 1979 to 1989; and former Clerk of the Legislative Assembly, 1987 to 2016, Dr. W.J. David McNeil.

# Speaker's Statement – Member's Anniversary

The Speaker made a statement in recognition of the fifth anniversary of Hon. Mr. Dreeshen, Minister of Transportation and Economic Corridors, who was elected to the Legislative Assembly in a by-election on July 12, 2018.

# Speaker's Statement – Items in Daily Routine

Honourable Members, before I call upon the Clerk to call the Daily Routine, I see that Government Motion 6, which appears on today's Order Paper, is proposing to amend a number of Standing Orders, including amendments with respect to two items in the Daily Routine: Introduction of Guests and Members' Statements.

The motion seeks, among other things, to amend Standing Order 7(3) to increase the time allotted each day for Members to make introductions under Introduction of Guests from four minutes to six minutes. In addition, an amendment has been proposed to Standing Order 7(4) to reduce the number of Members' Statements from seven to six per sitting day.

Although Government Motion 6 is not available for consideration until later this afternoon, I understand that two unanimous consent requests may be coming forward that would seek to give effect to these proposed amendments for this afternoon's routine.

Hon. Mr. Schow, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 7(3) in order to allow for Introduction of Guests for a period not exceeding six minutes and with each introduction not exceeding 20 seconds.

Unanimous consent is granted. Accordingly, Introduction of Guests this afternoon will be followed in the process I have outlined. I will remind Members that each introduction is to take a maximum of 20 seconds.

Is the Government House Leader prepared to request unanimous consent for the second request?

Hon. Mr. Schow, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 7(4) in order to allow for six Members' Statements in the order outlined in the House Leaders' Agreement dated October 26, 2023.

Unanimous consent has been granted.

# **Speaker's Statement** – Oral Question Period, Members' Statements Rotations, and Other Matters

Honourable Members, prior to proceeding to Members' Statements, I would like to outline the rotations that will apply for Oral Question Period and Members' Statements. The rotations were agreed to in the House Leaders' Agreement that I noted earlier today and which was provided with the procedural memo that my office sent out to all Members last Friday. Also attached to the procedural memo were an Oral Question Period rotation chart and a Projected Sitting Days Calendar, which contains, among other things, the Members' Statements rotation. With respect to Oral Question Period, the House Leaders' Agreement is based upon 16 questions each day and allows for a four-day rotation. The Official Opposition is entitled to ask the first five main questions as well as the seventh, eighth, 10th, 12th, 13th, 15th, and 16th question each day. Private Members of the Government caucus are entitled to the sixth, 11th, and 14th question each day and the ninth question on Days 1 to 3. The independent Member of the Assembly is entitled to ask the ninth question on Day 4 of the rotation. Today will be Day 1 of the four-day rotation.

I would like to remind Members that questions and responses should be no longer than 35 seconds in length and that preambles to supplementary questions are only allowed for the first four rounds of questioning each day, as indicated in the House Leaders' Agreement.

With respect to Members' Statements, the rotation is based upon a three-week schedule. In accordance with the unanimous consent request granted by the Assembly earlier today and if Government Motion 6 is agreed to by the Assembly, Standing Order 7(4) will provide that each day up to six private Members may make a statement of no more than two minutes in duration.

Private Members of the Government caucus are entitled to two statements on Tuesday and Thursday each week and on Wednesday of Week 3 of the rotation. They are also entitled to three statements on each Monday of the rotation and on Wednesday in Weeks 1 and 2 of the rotation. Members of the Official Opposition are entitled to three statements on Monday and Wednesday and four statements on Tuesday and Thursday of the three-week rotation. The independent Member is entitled to one statement on Wednesday of Week 3 of the rotation. This week is Week 1.

Since we are just starting the first sitting of the new Legislature, I would like to point out to Members that a number of parliamentary secretaries have been appointed. Please note that parliamentary secretaries are private Members, not members of Executive Council. Accordingly, they have the rights and duties of private Members, not of members of Cabinet.

I would refer Members to my ruling on November 30, 2022, which can be found on page 10 of Hansard for that day, and rulings by Speaker Wanner, which can be found on page 1599 of Hansard for October 30, 2017, and Speaker Kowalski, on April 16, 2008, which can be found on page 13 of Hansard for that day. All of these rulings indicate that it is inappropriate for parliamentary secretaries to direct questions to the Minister with whom the parliamentary secretary is affiliated. Accordingly, I would ask that parliamentary secretaries refrain from posing questions to their Ministers.

Finally, as we embark on this session, please remember that, in accordance with Standing Order 13(7), Members must be in their assigned seats when speaking or voting.

# **Members' Statements**

MLA Kayande, Hon. Member for Calgary-Elbow, made a statement regarding the Canada Pension Plan and a proposed alternative Alberta pension plan.

Hon. Ms Armstrong-Homeniuk, Hon. Member for Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville, made a statement regarding the accomplishments of the United Conservative Government.

Mr. Haji, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Decore, made a statement regarding the Israel-Hamas war and its effects on Albertans.

Mr. Boitchenko, Hon. Member for Drayton Valley-Devon, made a statement regarding the work of the Alberta Indigenous Opportunities Corporation to achieve economic reconciliation.

Hon. Mr. Eggen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-North West, made a statement regarding the effects of several Government polices on affordability and Albertans' health.

Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, made a statement regarding the report by Hon. Marguerite Trussler, K.C., Ethics Commissioner, into allegations involving the Premier.

## **Notices of Motions**

Hon. Mr. Schow, Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the intention to introduce the following Bill:

Bill 6 Public Health Amendment Act, 2023 — Hon. Mr. Amery

Hon. Ms Notley, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, gave oral notice of the intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 42:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly recognize carbon dioxide emissions contribute to a changing climate that has caused unprecedented wildfires, flooding, evacuations, and extreme weather events in Canada and around the world, while at the same time inflation has caused steep increases to household costs for all Canadians from coast to coast to coast, and therefore the Assembly believes the federal government's recent changes to climate policy announced October 26 should be applied to all Canadians, regardless of geography or home heating method, including natural gas.

# **Introduction of Bills (First Reading)**

Notice having been given:

- Bill 3 Opioid Damages and Health Care Costs Recovery Amendment Act, 2023 — Hon. Mr. Williams
  - 4

# **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Mr. Dach, Hon. Member for Edmonton-McClung:

Copy of lyrics to the song "Feelings"

Sessional Paper 2/2023

Hon. Mr. Cooper, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

Memorandum dated October 26, 2023, from Hon. Mr. Schow, Government House Leader, to Hon. Mr. Cooper, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, providing a signed House Leaders' Agreement regarding Oral Question Period and Members' Statements rotations for the Fall 2023 sitting

Sessional Paper 3/2023

Pursuant to the Conflicts of Interest Act, cC-23, s28(1), Office of the Ethics Commissioner, Province of Alberta, Report of Findings and Recommendations by Hon. Marguerite Trussler, K.C., Ethics Commissioner, into allegations involving Hon. Danielle Smith, Member for Brooks-Medicine Hat, Premier of Alberta

Sessional Paper 4/2023

Pursuant to the Conflicts of Interest Act, cC-23, s46(2), Office of the Ethics Commissioner of Alberta Annual Report, April 1, 2022, to March 31, 2023

Sessional Paper 5/2023

Pursuant to the Ombudsman Act, cO-8, s28, Alberta Ombudsman 2022-2023 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 6/2023

# **Tablings to the Clerk**

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Amery, Minister of Justice, pursuant to the Legal Profession Act, cL-8, s5(4):

Law Society of Alberta 2022 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 7/2023

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Nally, Minister of Service Alberta and Red Tape Reduction:

Pursuant to the Horse Racing Alberta Act, cH-11.5, s10(2), Horse Racing Alberta Annual Report 2022

Sessional Paper 8/2023

Pursuant to An Act to End Predatory Lending, cE-9.5, s4(2), An Act to End Predatory Lending 2022 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 9/2023

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. McIver, Minister of Municipal Affairs:

Pursuant to the Safety Codes Act, cS-1, s25(3), Safety Codes Council 2022 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 10/2023

Alberta Elevating Devices and Amusement Rides Safety Association Annual Report 2022-2023, with attached financial statements for the year ended March 31, 2023

Sessional Paper 11/2023

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Nicolaides, Minister of Education, pursuant to the Teaching Profession Act, cT-2, s15(2):

Alberta Teachers' Association 2022 Annual Report

Sessional Paper 12/2023

### **Motions Under Standing Order 42**

Hon. Ms Notley, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly recognize carbon dioxide emissions contribute to a changing climate that has caused unprecedented wildfires, flooding, evacuations, and extreme weather events in Canada and around the world, while at the same time inflation has caused steep increases to household costs for all Canadians from coast to coast to coast, and therefore the Assembly believes the federal government's recent changes to climate policy announced October 26 should be applied to all Canadians, regardless of geography or home heating method, including natural gas.

Pursuant to Standing Order 42(1.1) and (1.2), Hon. Ms Notley and Hon. Ms Schulz commented on the request for unanimous consent.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

# Apology by Member

Hon. Mr. Eggen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-North West, made a statement apologizing for a disturbance that occurred in the Chamber during the Speech from the Throne on October 30, 2023.

## Speaker's Statement - Order and Decorum in the Chamber

Honourable Members, before proceeding to Orders of the Day, I would like to make some remarks about order and decorum in the Chamber.

First, I would like to point out that many Members on both sides of the Assembly were using their phones during the Throne speech yesterday. It is stated very clearly on page 1 of the procedural memo, which I'm sure you all took the opportunity to read on Friday so you would have been well aware that in the procedural memo, I quote, "Members are reminded that electronic devices are not to be used during this ceremonial occasion."

In addition, there were photos circulating yesterday on social media of Members in the Chamber. Specifically, a photo was tweeted at 3:55, which must have been tweeted during the Throne speech. I can't begin to imagine or comprehend why, after reading the procedural memo, any Member of this Assembly would make such a decision to be disrespectful, not to me but to the institution of this Assembly.

It is noted in the procedural memo, under the section entitled "Electronic Devices in the Chamber," on pages 8 and 9, that "the use of any recording device, camera or pager ... is not permitted in the Chamber at any time."

I would also like to remind all Members that they should refrain from interacting on social media while participating in Assembly proceedings. In short, you or members of your team should not be tweeting from your accounts while you are present here in the Assembly.

Honourable Members, let us be mindful of order and decorum generally with respect to how we respect this storied institution and the decisions we make each day.

# **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

# **Government Motions**

2. Moved by Hon. Mr. Schow:

Be it resolved that the following committees be established for the duration of the Legislature:

- A. Five Select Standing Committees for the following purposes:
  - (1) Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and Printing;
  - (2) Public Accounts;
  - (3) Private Bills;
  - (4) Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund;
  - (5) Legislative Offices;
- B. A Special Standing Committee on Members' Services;
  - 7

- C. Three Legislative Policy Committees for the following purposes:
  - (1) Standing Committee on Families and Communities;
  - (2) Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future;
  - (3) Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

3. Moved by Hon. Mr. Schow:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly resolve into Committee of the Whole, when called, to consider certain Bills on the Order Paper.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

4. Moved by Hon. Mr. Schow:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly resolve into Committee of Supply, when called, to consider supply to be granted to His Majesty.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

5. Moved by Hon. Mr. Schow:

Be it resolved that the following Members be appointed to the Assembly's five Select Standing Committees, one Special Standing Committee, and three Legislative Policy Committees:

Standing	Committee	on	the	Alberta	Heritage	Savings	Trust	Fund
(9 Member	rs)							

Yao (Chair)	Bouchard	Kasawski
Rowswell (Deputy Chair)	Brar	Kayande
Boitchenko	Hunter	Wiebe

# Standing Committee on Legislative Offices (11 Members)

Getson (Chair)	Eremenko	Shepherd
van Dijken (Deputy Chair)	Hunter	Sinclair
Chapman	Long	Vacant
Dyck	Renaud	

### Standing Committee on Private Bills (11 Members)

Pitt (Chair)	Deol	Sigurdson (Edmonton-Riverview)
Stephan (Deputy Chair)	Dyck	Wright (Cypress-Medicine Hat)
Bouchard	Hayter	Vacant
Ceci	Petrovic	

Printing (12 Members)	in Trivileges and Elect	ions, Standing Orders a	
Yao (Chair)	Cyr	Stephan	
Armstrong-Homeniuk (Deputy Chair)	Dach	Wiebe	
Arcand-Paul	Gray	Vacant	
Ceci	Johnson	Vacant	
Standing Committee on	Public Accounts (12 Me	embers)	
Pancholi (Chair)	Ganley	McDougall	
Rowswell (Deputy Chair)	Најі	Schmidt	
Armstrong-Homeniuk	Lovely	Vacant	
de Jonge	Lunty	Vacant	
Special Standing Comn	nittee on Members' Serv	ices (11 Members)	
Cooper (Chair)	Long	Singh	
Getson (Deputy Chair)	Phillips	Yao	
Eggen	Rowswell	Vacant	
Gray	Sabir		
Standing Committee on	Alberta's Economic Fu	ture (12 Members)	
Getson (Chair)	de Jonge	Wright (Cypress-Medicine Hat)	
Loyola (Deputy Chair)	Elmeligi	Yao	
Boparai	Hoyle	Vacant	
Cyr	Stephan	Vacant	
Standing Committee on	Families and Communi	ties (12 Members)	
Lovely (Chair)	Long	Singh	
Goehring (Deputy Chair)	Lunty	Tejada	
Batten	Metz	Vacant	
Boitchenko	Petrovic	Vacant	
Standing Committee on	Resource Stewardship (	(12 Members)	
Rowswell (Chair)	Calahoo Stonehouse	Sinclair	
Schmidt (Deputy Chair)	Dyck	Sweet	
Al-Guneid	Hunter	Vacant	
Armstrong-Homeniuk	McDougall	Vacant	

# Standing Committee on Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

6. Moved by Hon. Mr. Schow:

A. Be it resolved that the Standing Orders of the Legislative Assembly of Alberta, effective November 30, 2022, be amended as follows:

- (a) in Standing Order 7
  - (i) in suborder (3) by striking out "not exceeding 4 minutes" and substituting "not exceeding 6 minutes", and
  - (ii) in suborder (4) by striking out "up to 7 Members" and substituting "up to 6 Members";
- (b) in Standing Order 52
  - (i) in suborder (1) by striking out clauses (a) to (e) and substituting the following:
    - (a) Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and Printing, consisting of 10 Members;
    - (b) Public Accounts, consisting of 10 Members;
    - (c) Private Bills, consisting of 10 Members;
    - (d) Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund, consisting of 9 Members;
    - (e) Legislative Offices, consisting of 10 Members.
  - (ii) in suborder (2) by striking out "consisting of 11 Members" and substituting "consisting of 10 Members";
- (c) in Standing Order 52.01(1)
  - (i) by striking out "consisting of 12 Members each" and substituting "consisting of 10 Members each", and
  - (ii) by striking out clauses (a) to (c) and substituting the following:
    - (a) the Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future is mandated to consider areas related to Advanced Education; Agriculture and Irrigation; Arts, Culture and Status of Women; Immigration and Multiculturalism; Infrastructure; Jobs, Economy and Trade; Technology and Innovation; Tourism and Sport;
    - (b) the Standing Committee on Families and Communities is mandated to consider areas related to Children and Family Services; Education; Health; Justice; Mental Health and Addiction; Public Safety and Emergency Services; Seniors, Community and Social Services; Service Alberta and Red Tape Reduction;
      - 10

(c) the Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship is mandated to consider areas related to Affordability and Utilities; Energy and Minerals; Environment and Protected Areas; Forestry and Parks; Indigenous Relations; Municipal Affairs; Transportation and Economic Corridors; Treasury Board and Finance.

B. And be it further resolved that the amendments set out in this motion come into force on passage.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

7. Moved by Hon. Mr. Schow:

Be it resolved that

(a) the Public Sector Compensation Transparency Act be referred to the Standing Committee on Families and Communities and the Committee shall be deemed to be the special committee of the Assembly for the purpose of conducting a comprehensive review pursuant to section 14 of that Act,

(b) the Committee may, without leave of the Assembly, sit during a period when the Assembly is adjourned or prorogued, and

(c) in accordance with section 14 of the Public Sector Compensation Transparency Act, the Committee must submit its report to the Assembly within six months after beginning its review and that report is to include any amendments recommended by the Committee.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

8. Moved by Hon. Ms Schulz on behalf of Hon. Mr. Schow:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government of Canada to

- (a) acknowledge the negative impact of the federal consumer carbon tax on the cost of living,
- (b) recognize that the recent exemption from the consumer carbon tax provided for home heating oil will create inequities amongst Canadians, particularly with respect to those in Alberta who use lower carbon-emitting heating sources for their homes, such as natural gas, and
- (c) take all necessary steps required to end the federal consumer carbon tax.

#### A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to. With Hon. Mr. Cooper in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 47

Armstrong-Homeniuk	Jones	Schow
Boitchenko	LaGrange	Schulz
Bouchard	Loewen	Sigurdson (Highwood)
Cyr	Long	Sinclair
de Jonge	Lovely	Singh
Dreeshen	Lunty	Smith
Dyck	McDougall	Stephan
Ellis	McIver	Turton
Fir	Nally	van Dijken
Getson	Neudorf	Wiebe
Glubish	Nicolaides	Williams
Guthrie	Nixon	Wilson
Horner	Petrovic	Wright (Cypress-Medicine Hat)
Hunter	Pitt	Yao
Jean	Rowswell	Yaseen
Johnson	Sawhney	
Against the motion: 26		
Arcand-Paul	Elmeligi	Metz
Batten	Eremenko	Renaud
Brar	Goehring	Sabir
Calahoo Stonehouse	Gray	Schmidt
Ceci	Hayter	Shepherd
Chapman	Irwin	Sigurdson (Edmonton-Riverview)
Dach	Kasawski	Tejada
-		

# Consideration of Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor's Speech

Kayande

Loyola

Moved by Ms Lovely and seconded by Mr. Lunty:

That an humble address be presented to Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor as follows:

Wright (Edmonton-Beverly-Clareview)

To Her Honour, the Honourable Salma Lakhani, AOE, B.Sc., LLD (hon), the Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Alberta:

We, His Majesty's most dutiful and loyal subjects, the Legislative Assembly, now assembled, beg leave to thank Your Honour for the gracious speech Your Honour has been pleased to address to us at the opening of the present session.

A debate followed.

Eggen Ellingson

Dr. Elmeligi moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

# Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Williams, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:54 p.m. until Wednesday, November 1, 2023, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Nathan M. Cooper, Speaker

Title: Tuesday, October 31, 2023